Disposition: Resolved

OMG Issue No: SBVR 15-08

*Legacy Issue Number:* 19680

Title: The use of UML described in the Annex does not represent any known UML tool nor the UML specification

Source:

Pete Rivett (pete.rivett@adaptive.com)

Summary:

The use of UML described in the Annex[[1]](#footnote-1) does not represent any known UML tool nor the UML specification. The examples are UML-like diagrams presumably created with a drawing tool.

* In Figure C.1 the right hand class is shown with 2 names and an italicized label “also:” this is not supported.
* Section C.3 and Figure C.2: in UML, Instance diagrams only the class and not the instance name is ever underlined
* Figure 6.3[[2]](#footnote-2) is not a valid UML diagram if the lower shapes are InstanceSpecifications: they should have a colon after the names which should not be underlined. The use of Dependencies is not valid for class membership.
* Figure 6.4[[3]](#footnote-3) is not valid an association may have only one name optionally accompanied by one direction indicator.
* Figure C.7, C.12: In general UML does not include the notion of underline/font within a name: it’s modeled only as a text string.
* Figure C.9 is not valid one cannot have an association with only one end.
* C.7.1, Figure 14: these 2 renderings are semantically identical in UML and serialized the same in XMI. UML has the ability to render the distinction using a GeneralizationSet with isDisjoint so why not use that?
* C.15: powertypes should not have a name before the colon in UML, though the property of type “branch type” may
* C.9, Figure C.17: the dashed lien to association diamond is not valid in UML.

Resolution:

Clarify that the diagrams in Clauses 7–21 do not depict UML conventions nor the use of any UML tool and that the documentation in Annex C describes the conventions used for the kind of diagram called a 'concept model diagram' (or 'vocabulary diagram'), not a UML diagram. Reword the relevant places in the SBVR document to clarify that these conventions and diagrams do ***not*** represent UML and carry no UML semantics.

Revised Text:

In clause 5 (pg. 10), **change** the second paragraph from:

Figures in Clauses 8 through 21 depict the SBVR XMI Metamodel using notational conventions described in Clause 23. For the purpose of visualizing vocabularies, Annex C describes a non-normative interpretation of those same figures and of figures in Annex G. Other non-normative notations used in Clauses 7 through 21 are explained in Annexes A and H.

to

For the purpose of visualizing SBVR vocabularies, Annex C describes a non-normative interpretation of the figures in Clauses 7–21 and of figures in Annex G. Other non-normative notations used in Clauses 7 through 21 are explained in Annex A.

In sub clause 6.1.1 (pg. 11), **add** this third bullet point to the list headed by the paragraph that begins "Good preparation for reading the specification…":

* Annex C, Use of a business-friendly notation to visualize the connections between SBVR Vocabularies entries.

In sub clause 6.1.1 (pg. 11), **delete** the fourth bullet point from the list headed by the paragraph that begins "General practitioners will find…".

In clause 23, **change** according to the changed-tracked attachment:  
 “Changes to SBVR v1.4 Clause 23 that are Part of SBVR Issue 15-08 Resolution.docx”

In clauses 8-21, **change** the annotation line following every figure caption from:

This diagram shows the SBVR XMI Metamodel and SBVR vocabulary by two different interpretations. See Clause 13 and Annex C.

to

This diagram shows the SBVR terminological entries of this sub clause as explained in Annex C.

In clauses 8-21, **replace** the following 34 diagrams with the images in the attached zip file:

SBVR 1.5 PNGs.zip

* 8.3
* 8.8
* 8.9
* 8.11
* 8.12
* 9.1
* 11.1
* 11.2
* 11.3
* 12.1
* 12.4
* 12.8
* 12.10
* 13.1
* 14.3
* 14.4
* 14.6
* 14.10
* 15.1
* 16.1
* 18.1
* 19.1
* 19.2
* 19.3
* 19.4
* 19.5
* 19.6
* 19.7
* 20.1
* 20.2
* 21.3
* 21.7
* 21.8
* 21.12

**Replace** Annex C with the revised source:

* SBVR 1.4 Annex C (190509).docx

The change-tracked history is provided as audit trail:

* SBVR 1.4 Annex C (190509)-CT.docx

Disposition: Resolved

1. This refers to Annex C in SBVR 1.4 [↑](#footnote-ref-1)
2. Figure C.3, not 6.3 [↑](#footnote-ref-2)
3. Figure C.4, not 6.4 [↑](#footnote-ref-3)